Spotlight on Direct Service Gaps

The Landscape of Comprehensive Care for Adult Survivors of Trafficking



Table of Contents

About Restore

II. Introduction

I.

III. Leaders Interviewed

IV. Highlights from the Report

Survivor Perspectives

Service

V.

VII.

VIII.

VI. Disparities by Geography

> Service Provider Perspectives

Meet the Leaders

IX. Appendix

Author: Sandra Diaz Contributors: Jakki Bedsole, Sarah Caldwell, Shaina Fuller, Laura Hackney, Ida Kaastra-Mutoigo, John Nehme, Carolyne Ouya, Katie Steinberg, National Survivor Advocate, Beck Sullivan, Rachel Voigt, Fen Wang, Kristi Wells

Copyright © 2023-2024 Restore NYC All rights reserved.

About Restore

Restore exists to make freedom real for survivors of trafficking in the United States. Since 2009, Restore has served more than 2,500 adult survivors and people at risk of 104 nationalities, delivering long-term, trauma-informed, and culturally-sensitive interventions in the three areas survivors have said are essential for sustained freedom from trafficking: housing, economic empowerment, and wellbeing (counseling and case management).

Based in New York City, Restore activates strategic cross-sector collaboration to promote impact-driven solutions. This includes referrals to Restore from over 150 sources across 30+ states, emergency housing provided through alliances with 60+ hotels and shelters, and partnerships with 70+ businesses which have provided 200+ service contracts and direct hire jobs in a 7-year period. In addition, multi-year federal grants from the Office of Victims of Crime (OVC) and Office on Violence Against Women (OVW) enable Restore to access and inform best practices in the field.

This report is the next in a series of white papers that Restore has published to serve as resources to the anti-trafficking field:

- Impact Unlocked (2023) focused on best practices for impact assessment and program outcomes evaluation.
- Path to Freedom (2022) shared best practices in economic empowerment through survivor entrepreneurship.
- Road to Recovery (2021) brought to light the impacts of COVID-19.

This year Restore hopes to continue that momentum by curating best practices and learning related to gaps in direct services for adult survivors of trafficking, based on both survivors' and organizations' perspectives.

For more information, please visit our website:

restorenyc.org



Introduction

According to the 2021 Trafficking in Persons Report, human trafficking has become the second largest criminal activity across the globe, rapidly approaching drug trafficking. Walk Free's 2023 Global Slavery Index report estimated there are 1,091,000 people in modern slavery in the United States alone. This represents a 170% increase in the number of people in trafficking situations over the last five years, when comparing the latest figures to Walk Free's 2018 estimate. With this, rapid growth in the need for survivor services was observed among a subset of Department of Justice (DOJ) anti-trafficking grantees, who reported 16,390 open client cases from July 1, 2021, to June 30, 2022, a significant increase from the same subset reporting 10,070 open client cases the previous year.

Given the size and scope of the problem, Restore has embarked on data-driven, long-range strategic planning to ensure greater impact. Thus, in May of 2023 Restore initiated research to understand gaps in service delivery for survivors of human trafficking. Leadership sought to identify geographies lacking services for survivors, services requested but so-far unavailable, and gaps in training and technical assistance to achieve best-in-class service delivery and impact assessment. Restore's findings will inform its approach to expanding offerings.

In the data collection process, Restore encountered difficulties finding the information needed for decision-making, particularly related to the number of organizations in the U.S. serving survivors and specific services available to them by geography. Sources that cross-referenced gaps from the perspective of service providers against survivors' stated needs and satisfaction with getting those needs met were also hard to find.

Restore compiled the findings to provide other anti-trafficking organizations serving adult survivors a central source of data for strategic planning related to direct service provision. This centralized data should allow organizations to compare needs and gaps from both the survivor and service provider's perspective, review availability of national and state services, and identify areas for improvement. Restore hopes this resource helps organizations develop their three-to five-year growth plans, so survivors can access what they need to thrive.

While progress has been made in the fight against trafficking, our analysis uncovered the persistent challenges survivors face in accessing the help they need to live and to reach their goals. These gaps must be urgently addressed through multi-sector collaboration, survivor leadership, technology, and increased funding.

Leaders Interviewed



Jakki Bedsole

Product Manager AnnieCannons anniecannons.org resourcefullapp.org



Shaina Fuller

Task Force Director Brooklyn Human Trafficking Task Force, Kings County District Attorney's Office brooklynda.org/human-trafficking



Laura Hackney

Chief Executive Officer and Cofounder AnnieCannons *anniecannons.org resourcefullapp.org*



John Nehme President and Chief Executive Officer Allies Against Slavery

Allies Against Slavery alliesagainstslavery.org





Carolyne Ouya

Program Manager, Economic Security & Mobility Futures Without Violence futureswithoutviolence.org

Katie Steinberg

Partnerships Manager, National Human Trafficking Hotline | Polaris humantraffickinghotline.org polarisproject.org



National Survivor Advocate



Fen Wang

Mixed Media Artist and Restore Survivor Advisory Board Member *restorenyc.org*

Kristi Wells

Chief Executive Officer Safe House Project safehouseproject.org



Highlights from the Report

Restore developed this report to shed light on the many gaps in services for survivors and provide organizations serving adult survivors a central source of data for strategic planning as it relates to direct services. By comparing needs and gaps from the perspective of survivors and other service providers, reviewing availability of services at the national and state levels, and considering the ideas for improvement offered, Restore hopes organizations can refine their approach to growth for the next three to five years so survivors can have access to the resources they need to thrive.

With a clearer path to improve services for survivors, organizations can also accelerate partnerships within local anti-trafficking task forces and further mobilize support from financial partners, businesses, government and other stakeholders. In this way, the field can counter the sophisticated business model behind the growing crime of human trafficking, which currently impacts an estimated 1,091,000 people in the United States. This figure represents a 170% increase versus the estimated number of people in trafficking situations in 2018.



While progress has been made, there is still an urgent need to bridge persistent gaps: service providers, funders, and government must continue to refine their efforts on multi-sector collaboration, survivor leadership, technology, and funding, to effectively help survivors achieve their life goals.

Low availability of services relative to survivors expressed needs: survivors lack employment assistance, education/training, and housing options, and currently have a neutral level of satisfaction with their ability to get these needs met.

States and cities lacking organizations relative to the population at risk: the National Human Trafficking Hotline lacks publicly-listed service providers in Georgia, California (Riverside-San Bernardino, Los Angeles), New York (New York City), Texas, Florida, Illinois, Louisiana (Baton Rouge), Alabama, Arizona (Tucson), Mississippi (Jackson), New Jersey, Memphis-TN, Richmond-VA, Oklahoma City-OK, and Charlotte-NC.

Recommendations

Below are the top opportunities to close gaps in services, identified by Restore from the data collection, and interviews with two survivors and six service provider organizations:

For Service Providers

- Engage survivors in strategy. Identify priorities with input from survivor advisory councils, focus groups, or surveys.
- Launch economic empowerment. Address survivors' top need with comprehensive, trafficking-specific services that promote their economic security, such as job placement, entrepreneurship incubation, education grants, credit repair, and trauma-informed financial literacy.
- Match survivor diversity. Consider the needs of labor trafficking, male, transgender, single, and pregnant survivors, families with teens, substance users, and those with acute mental health needs.
- Focus on enrichment as well as basic needs. Invite survivors to free cultural, outdoor, and hobby activities that bring joy and foster exploration.
- Start a part-time drop-in center. Give survivors a place to spend time, use computers, share a meal, learn, and meet basic needs.

For Financial Partners

- Close emergency housing gaps. Sponsor 10 new specialized facilities, which can serve 10-12 survivors with an annual budget of \$500,000 to \$750,000 each.
- Fund cash assistance programs. Contribute to addressing the national housing and education affordability issue which creates barriers to lasting freedom.
- Provide capacity-building resources. Award grants for organizations to hire and train staff on trauma-informed care, fundraising, and impact assessment.

For Businesses

- Create trauma-informed workplaces. Worker protections and trauma-informed supervision will lead to higher employee retention and improved productivity.
- Consider survivors in inclusive hiring and retention practices. Extend hiring to non-traditional candidates, and train on the job in lieu of requiring formal education.
- Contribute to affordable independent living. Partner with service providers to offer below-market rentals, securing income from government and private funding.

For Government Agencies

- Promote data collaboration. Establish grant incentives for service providers to share outcomes, providing a broader view to inform decisions.
- Facilitate trafficking-specific housing. Assess for trafficking in domestic violence shelters to dedicate a portion of them exclusively to survivors of trafficking.
- Convene federally-funded task forces. Invite them to share best practices and challenges, evaluate the state of their collaboration, and create annual plans.



Survivor Perspectives Restore Survey

The voices of survivors are essential to understand gaps in services and needs of this population. Exploring their experiences, challenges, and triumphs ensures that anti-trafficking responses are not built solely on assumptions and idyllic models but also grounded in the diverse and dynamic needs of those directly affected.

Measuring survivor satisfaction with the resources available to them for addressing their needs offers valuable insights into the effectiveness of current anti-trafficking services. Such an evaluation also highlights areas for potential improvement.

As part of its strategic planning process, Restore surveyed 146 individuals enrolled in its core services in July 2023, generating n=86 responses. Survivors were asked to identify their needs, how they sought to meet those needs, the level of satisfaction with getting those needs met (rated on scale from 1=extremely dissatisfied to 5=extremely satisfied), and new services of interest to them.

Figure 1. Number of survivors expressing need for support in a specific area (see vertical axis) versus level of satisfaction with getting those needs met (see horizontal axis, scale: 1=extremely dissatisfied to 5=extremely satisfied)



Average Satisfaction

As seen in Figure 1, employment assistance and basic needs were mentioned by most respondents, but they had a neutral level of satisfaction with their ability to get those economic-related needs met (score is 2.8, which is the middle of the scale). The next set of needs include: benefits access, training/education, housing and legal assistance. Survivors were dissatisfied with benefits access (2.5 score), had a neutral level of satisfaction regarding training/education options (3.1 score), and felt slightly positive about their ability to obtain housing and legal assistance (3.3 and 3.5 score respectively).



Figure 2 shows survivors' approach to getting those needs met. While a majority worked with organizations to address their needs, many were also meeting them on their own since they are resourceful, resilient individuals. There were also a high number of survivors not addressing their needs at the time. Note that the skew towards working with organizations may not be representative of all survivors of trafficking since Restore only surveyed individuals who are currently receiving services.

Availability of Organizations to Meet Survivors' Needs

Along with exploring survivors' needs and level of satisfaction, Restore evaluated the availability of different types of services for survivors by geography. While there is no widely available, complete list of anti-trafficking organizations, the National Human Trafficking Hotline would have the most comprehensive list since they connect victims and survivors of sex and labor trafficking with services and supports to get help and stay safe. The Hotline also receives tips about potential situations of sex and labor trafficking and facilitates reporting that information to the appropriate authorities in certain cases. The Hotline is a crisis line, and therefore it is not a direct services provider or a law enforcement agency.

After speaking with representatives from Polaris, the organization contracted by the federal government to operate the Hotline, Restore identified **the Hotline's public online Referral Directory** as a primary resource to determine the availability of services for survivors. The list includes n=660 organizations, of which 212 (32%) are classified as Tier 1, given they focus exclusively on survivors of trafficking. An additional 448 organizations are classified as Tier 2, which means they do not focus solely on anti-trafficking work, but have a dedicated point person or program to meet the needs of survivors of trafficking.

While the Hotline has around 1,200 service provider partners in the U.S. and U.S. territories, it is important to note that Restore's analysis was conducted only on the organizations that gave the Hotline permission to list their information publicly, and that the Hotline has deemed appropriate for listing in their public directory. This list does not constitute the total number of providers that are serving victims and survivors in the nation as some organizations may choose not to be listed on the hotline, the Hotline may choose not to partner with specific organizations, or the Hotline is unaware of service providers and thus has not yet invited them to join the directory. More about how the Hotline develops partnerships is discussed on page 32.

Figures 3 and 4 on the following page were created to compare the total number of organizations in the Hotline's public referral directory that deliver specific types of services against the needs stated by survivors in the survey. A more detailed analysis of coverage by geography is provided in the next section on page 25.



Figure 3. Services available for survivors of human trafficking in the United States

(n=660)490 74% Case Management 324 49% Crisis Services 321 49% Supportive Counseling 296 45% Transportation Assistance 250 38% Emergency Shelter Despite 31% 204 Legal Services - Civil 195 30% Legal Services - Immigration Mental Health Services 182 28% 179 Health Care 27% 172 26% Transitional housing 25% Family Reunification 167 general Education/Job Training 142 22% 19% Addiction Treatment 128 18% Long-term Housing 117 15% Legal Services - Criminal 102 15% Drop-In Center 101 Child Care 57 9% Repatriation 8% 52 5% Interpretation/Translation 31 20 Residential Mental Health 3% Number of Organizations Providing Service 100 200 300 0 400 500

% of organizations

employment assistance and education/training being survivors' top need mentioned by close to half (49%) of Restore's survey respondents, only 22% of publicly-listed organizations provide those services as shown in Figure 3. Where that need is met by service providers for the population, providing them training and technical assistance should result in improvements in survivors' satisfaction in this area.

15

Figure 4. Beds available in the United States for use by survivors of human trafficking (n=8,386 total beds available)



Survivors also lack options for maintaining housing stability, as Figure 3 shows that 26% of publicly-listed transitional organizations provide housing, and only 18% of those organizations provide long-term housing. In addition, as seen in Figure 4 there are 8,386 beds available to survivors in publicly-listed organizations, of which only 19% are found at providers solely dedicated to anti-trafficking work.

In conclusion, the lack of survivor satisfaction with their ability to get their needs met, the high percentage of survivors choosing to address those priority needs on their own or not address them, and the lack of organizations to provide services particularly in the economic empowerment area demonstrates there are still significant gaps in services to be addressed at a nationwide level. The two profiles that follow illustrate how survivor advocates perceive available services, and their thoughts on how service providers can address observed gaps.

National Survivor Advocate



National Survivor Advocate

Provide support to navigate tax and credit issues, rights education, and male-targeted services

Gaps Observed

Based on his personal experience and work with other survivors, the National Survivor Advocate identified three barriers to survivors' sustained freedom:

- Financial stability and economic mobility related to survivors' unique needs:
 - *Tax assistance* for preparing returns, obtaining tax credits and learning how refunds work.
 - Long-term credit repair including removal of debt incurred as a result of coercion by traffickers from their credit report.
 - *Financial education* for saving, budget planning, and financial planning.
 - For survivors who want to work in the anti-trafficking field, availability of full-time jobs with benefits and employment opportunities where they can add value beyond sharing their trafficking story.

- ♥ Understanding of rights, whether or not survivors have a criminal or civil case, or no legal case at all. Rights workshops should be provided at the same time that organizations are helping survivors stabilize through housing or health care, since it is critical knowledge for labor trafficking survivors, especially immigrants.
 - The pressure to send money back home and inability to obtain immediate work authorization creates vulnerability leading to re-victimization, when individuals do not know the rights available to them regardless of immigration status nor have a plan to claim those rights.
 - Rights information also allows individuals to recognize red flags related to a prospective employer so they can avoid being re-trafficked.

- Availability of gender-responsive services, particularly for males.
 - Imagery focused on women and girls used in anti-trafficking public education campaigns and service provider websites is not conducive to males realizing that they have been victimized and can receive support.
 - Since identification of male survivors is harder, providers are not well prepared to serve them. For example, because there is a lack of dedicated housing for male survivors, males may falselv claim they have disorder to substance use access housing that is more readily available.

Recommendations

The National Survivor Advocate shared the following specific ideas so that survivors do not have to navigate financial and rights challenges on their own:

Coordinate on-site tax preparation. In the past Restore successfully helped survivor entrepreneurs file taxes by partnering with Community Tax Aid -NYC, the oldest free tax preparation service in the country. It is an independent, all-volunteer, non-profit serving low-income individuals and families since 1969.

Q Provide credit repair support.

- The NJ Coalition Against Human Trafficking and Polaris have developed this guide to navigating the credit repair process that organizations can use to help survivors navigate this new and changing process related to the Debt Bondage Repair Act. Support is especially needed for survivors who must secure victim determination documents from one of the few available authorized non-governmental service providers.
- Organizations can also embark in advocacy with the Consumer Financial Protection Bureau to ensure survivors are informed about their credit repair options. For example, information and eligibility requirements could be prominently displayed at Federal Credit Unions.

Invite U.S. Department of Labor representatives and personal bankers to speak to survivors.

- While survivors can claim their labor rights without the need for service provider involvement, a personal and trusted connection at the Wage and Hour Division will help them counteract threats of retaliation by traffickers when they raise concerns about right violations.
- Survivors can also open a bank account or attend a personal finance workshop as any member of the general public, but programs such as the Survivor Inclusion Initiative created by FAST (Finance Against Slavery & Trafficking) engage banks to consider the impact of traffickers' control over survivors' money and credit, thus eliminating barriers to financial access.



Advocate for diversification of imagery and language in outreach efforts. This will encourage more males to seek support, proving that there is a high need for male-targeted services, and supporting the case for incremental funding to provide housing for male survivors. Restore had a similar experience ensuring that LGBTQ+ survivors safe accessing its services, revising its website based on recommendations by Taylan Stulting from the New York State Office of Victim Services Training & Technical Assistance Request Program (OVS TTARP).

Restore Survivor Advisory Board Member

🔶 Restore



Fen Wang Mixed Media Artist and Restore Survivor Advisory Board Member

Offer enrichment activities, explain illicit massage risks, and serve survivors' kids

Gaps Observed

Fen Wang, a member of Restore's Survivor Advisory Board, pointed out the following gaps especially applicable to Asians trafficked in illicit massage businesses (IMBs):

- Lack of information about workplace safety. People do not know about the risks of working at IMBs, and are unaware of other safer options available to them that are both interesting and allow them to generate a similar income.
- Cultural dissonance when accessing resources. Chinese people are used to seeking support from within their familial networks, so receiving services from a nonprofit involves a culture shock for Chinese survivors that is not being addressed by organizations.

- C Lack of alignment on how to sustain freedom. Service providers focus primarily on meeting the basic needs of survivors, and less on activities that can give them a lasting impact on their life direction, happiness, and exploration.
- Lack of culturally appropriate food. Many Chinese survivors are unable to adjust to the diet of bread, cheese, and canned food available at food pantries.
- Lack of attention to financial planning. Nonprofits are not explaining how long it will take to get housed and placed in a job, nor helping survivors to plan for sustenance in the interim. Thus, they may incur credit card debt and borrow money from family assuming those are short-term loans they can repay quickly.
- Lack of strategies for learning English. Organizations do not actively guide survivors to resolve the difficulties and psychological conflicts that arise in the process of learning English.
- Lack of trauma therapy for children of survivors. Programs are not serving children, youth and adults impacted by their parents' trafficking experience, related poverty and neglect, and overall increase in mental health issues among teenagers and young adults.

Recommendations

- Conduct outreach in community organizations and through WeChat. Service providers, government, universities, and neighborhoods can develop awareness campaigns that leverage trusted sources of information such as community centers and WeChat. The goal is to explain how trafficking and IMBs work, how to pursue alternative economic options, how local nonprofits operate, and how to get support by calling 311 or the National Human Trafficking Hotline.
 - Create barriers to re-trafficking by offering enrichment and social activities. Invite survivors to free cultural, outdoor and hobby-themed activities so they can develop new personal goals and social connections, decreasing their desire to return to traffickers for support. Service providers can also encourage survivors to read books such as "The Power of Now" by Eckhart Tolle and "Not Afraid of Being Alone" by Su Hei to discover their own powerful inner strength.

- Provide advisors academic and Ο counselors as part of ESL services. Help survivors clarify their goal of English, make plans learning for pursuing education including time financial management, and considerations, psychological and better prepare for the changes resulting from learning.
- Remind survivors to pursue financial health along with personal growth. Encourage them to think often about their financial situation and make long-term plans to achieve economic security, so they can experience a good quality of life.
- Expand counseling services to children 0 of survivors of all ages. Connect and their families survivors to professionals that specialize in trauma-informed services and are well-versed in the impact of trafficking on families.
- survivors find Help employment beyond repetitive, low-wage jobs. Organizations can focus on engaging more businesses, communities, schools, and government agencies to offer meaningful work for survivors. Restore has given survivors an opportunity to present a proposal to be awarded a limited number of education grants, which has drawn interest from about 10 times more survivors than the average job opening. It also surfaced job placements that Restore doesn't usually pursue on behalf of survivors such as bus driver or permanent makeup artist. Some grants were as low as \$2,500 and vet allowed survivors to secure employment at over \$50,000 per year. While it was not possible to assist everybody, resources were identified for all to take steps toward their goals, and both survivors and staff were inspired in the process.

24



Service Disparities by Geography

As mentioned previously, Restore used public data from the National Human Trafficking Hotline referral directory to compare availability of services to survivors' stated needs. To determine a specific market focus for Restore's activities, the same data was also analyzed at the state and city level. To ensure comparisons could be drawn across geographies, Restore calculated the ratio of population with high risk for trafficking (people of color in poverty, from the U.S. Census American Community Survey estimate for 2021) to the number of publicly-listed anti-trafficking organizations in the state from the Hotline's referral directory.

Underserved Areas Based on Total Number of Organizations

The states shaded in teal in Figure 5 on the next page had the highest ratios of population at risk per anti-trafficking organization in the area, and thus were determined to be the most underserved. The top 11 underserved states are: Georgia, California, New York, Texas, Florida, Illinois, Louisiana, Alabama, Arizona, Mississippi, and New Jersey. Seven of these 11 states are also among the top 10 for number of trafficking cases per state identified by the National Human Trafficking Hotline in 2021.



Figure 5. State heat map for the ratio of population at risk per anti-trafficking provider

Similarly, cities shaded in red in Figure 6 below had the highest ratios of population at risk per anti-trafficking organization in the area, and thus were determined to be the most underserved: Memphis-TN, Oklahoma City-OK, Riverside-San Bernardino-CA, Greater Los Angeles-CA, Greater New York City-NY, Richmond-VA, Charlotte-NC, Tucson-AZ, Jackson-MS, and Baton Rouge-LA.

Darker red shades indicate a higher ratio, which means there are less publicly-listed organizations in the city relative to the population at risk (people of color in poverty).



Underserved Areas Based on Availability of Specific Services

Restore calculated the ratio of population at risk per publicly-listed organization providing specific types of services. The lists on the next page show the five states with the highest ratios (most underserved) for each of the key services related to survivors' most pressing needs.

The states appearing at least four times in these lists were primarily located in the Southeast (Georgia, Alabama, Mississippi, South Carolina). Illinois, and Colorado were also mentioned multiple times.

Florida, Texas and Missouri, which are adjacent to the states mentioned above, were underserved states for housing-related services and legal-criminal services.

Michigan and New York were underserved on Education/Training options.

Though Wyoming does not have a large population of people of color in poverty, there were no publicly-listed organizations dedicated to the needs of survivors in-state related to emergency shelter, transitional housing, and legal-civil services.



*States with no Tier 1/2 services: MT, NM, RI, SD, WY

*States with no Tier 1/2 services: ID

30



Service Provider Perspectives

National Human Trafficking Hotline	32
AnnieCannons - ResourceFull App	36
Allies Against Slavery - Lighthouse Platform	43
Brooklyn Human Trafficking Task Force	50
Futures Without Violence	55
Safe House Project	61
Focus on Northeast Service Providers	66

National Human Trafficking Hotline

NATIONAL HUMAN TRAFFICKING HOTLINE



Katie Steinberg Partnerships Manager, National Human Trafficking Hotline Polaris

Standards for vetting referral partners, and challenges to serving labor trafficking survivors

Mission

As mentioned previously, the Hotline is intended to serve as a resource and thus currently has about 1,200 service provider referral partners, 660 of which are listed in their public directory as directly serving survivors. The Hotline also partners with organizations that meet general population needs such as shelters, not listed in the public directory, since those providers can meet survivors' needs when a dedicated trafficking program is not available in an area. Plus, the Hotline partners with 1,500 law enforcement professionals that refer survivors to the Hotline, and provide a trusted resource for the Hotline and those survivors who request a connection to the authorities.

• Vetting Service Provider Partners for the Referral Directory

The Hotline's Partnerships Manager, Katie Steinberg, shared that her team selects partners using the guidelines and expectations for organizations to be included in the National Human Trafficking Referral Directory, in keeping with their obligations related to Polaris' agreement with the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, and their own organizations' survivor-centered and justice-driven mission. Some of the key selection criteria include:

• Track record of service to survivors and financial stability over multiple years.

- Good standing and strong relationships with anti-trafficking task forces in the areas where they operate.
- Clear policies and expectations that ensure a good fit between the organization and survivors being referred.
- Fit with the Hotline's mission and values, for example, ensuring that a partner:
 - Does not require survivors to pay or work to obtain services.
 - Does not engage in rescue operations apart from law enforcement.
 - Uses website and marketing imagery that honors survivors, and accurately
 portrays trafficking situations and the demographics of survivors.
- Responsiveness to requests for updated information, though providers can always reapply if they are removed from the directory for lack of communication.

The Hotline's Partnerships team has three to five staff who review applications, dialog with the applicants about their fit for receiving referrals, check on applicants' reputation in the communities where they operate, and initiate and maintain relationships with partners once they are approved to join the directory. One of the more challenging aspects of their work is understanding an applicant's reputation, since that is a relational process. Getting a sense for an applicant's good standing is easier in areas where the task force is well funded and its coordinator knows all the key stakeholders, or in states that require organizations to abide by **standards of service such as those of the North Carolina Human Trafficking Commission.** For additional resources related to standards of service, see the Appendix on page 77.

A separate Hotline staff team connects survivors to the vetted referral partners. However, the Partnerships team may receive feedback from survivors regarding their referral experience, which they address as part of ongoing partner management.


Opportunities to Better Serve Survivors of Labor Trafficking

Katie notes that identifying and serving labor trafficking survivors, primarily males, is challenging due to the following reasons:

- The general public is more familiar and supportive of the need to address sex trafficking. Organizations in the field skew toward serving women, girls, and female-identifying individuals.
- Labor trafficking often goes unseen. Victims can work in construction, or at hotels, restaurants, nail salons, or meat processing facilities. Traffickers are often established businesses that operate with licenses and pay their taxes. Identifying victims and traffickers can be more difficult in those situations.
- Many labor trafficking victims may not know what happened to them is a crime. They may not know they are able to reach out for assistance.
- Many labor trafficking victims may be too afraid to reach out for assistance due to immigration status, or safety issues.

- Labor trafficking victims in rural areas may not be able to access a cell phone signal to contact the Hotline.
- Service providers can often be 50, 100, or 150 miles away from rural areas.
- Survivors of labor trafficking often seek wage and hour legal remedies, and immigration legal services. These are services that organizations that focus on serving sex trafficking victims often do not have.
- On occasion law enforcement extracts large amounts of people from labor trafficking sites such as farms. Law enforcement and or the victims may sometimes contact the hotline seeking immediate assistance with shelter, transportation, and other services for a large group of 40-200 people. Resources for adult males in a specific geographic area are often very limited, so large requests can be challenging to fulfill.





Jakki Bedsole Product Manager AnnieCannons



Laura Hackney Chief Executive Officer and Cofounder AnnieCannons

Connecting Survivors to the Right Resources, the First Time

Mission

AnnieCannons is a nonprofit organization with the mission to train, prepare, and connect individuals who have experienced human trafficking to sustainable careers in tech. Their services focus on three areas:

- **1.** Coding Training: They use a survivor-centered pedagogy and curriculum to equip survivors with skills in advanced and in-demand technologies.
- **2.** Job Readiness: They connect participants with mentors and workshops to build confidence and readiness in the workplace.
- **3.** Community Connection: They use real software projects to provide graduates with on-the-job experience building software. ResourceFull is one of the projects that students work on to develop skills for their future careers.

Gaps Observed

Laura Hackney, Chief Executive Officer and Cofounder, and Jakki Bedsole, Product Manager have observed the following gaps among AnnieCannons' participants and their experience with service providers:

- Lack of unique housing solutions, focused on long-term, non-traditional options rather than short-term shelters or transitional housing programs.
- Lack of flexible cash assistance, to address various needs, including housing, food, childcare, and other expenses not covered by existing sources of benefits.
- Lack of high-skill, high-pay workforce development programs, that lead to employment opportunities that provide livable wages and opportunity for growth.

- Lack of mental health care providers with lived experience, or that are at least well-versed in the complexities of trafficking.
- Lack of clear, transparent data about service providers and their eligibility criteria, preventing access to support even when there is no gap in services offered.
- ♥ Not considering survivor exhaustion and retraumatization at intake, due to the search for services and having to repeat their story to enroll at each organization.

ResourceFull

WEEKLY MESSAGE

Telling the truth really can set you free.

YOUR PROFILE

 Let's find your matches! Answer a few profile questions to find services that you are eligible for.
 Your answers are always saved so you can reuse them.

HELP & TUTORIALS

Services

?

Home

Visit our help area to see a tour and learn some tips about how to get the most out of this app!

Н

My Profile

Sign Out

Addressing Gaps: ResourceFull App

As part of its product development focus, AnnieCannons has developed a software platform called ResourceFull, which is geared toward connecting survivors to the right resources and streamlining the intake process. It will be piloted in 2024, with the goal to serve 100 survivors and acquire 150 service provider partners by the end of the year. If survivors and partners engage with the app as expected, they estimate it will serve more than 250 survivors in 2025.

ResourceFull allows survivors to filter for eligible resources using demographic and categorical data. Once they identify the best organizations to meet their unique needs, they can submit requests for services without having to fill out a new application each time. Survivors can revoke access to their personal information at any time.

This approach improves the current referral process by making it easier for survivors to identify organizations where there is a good fit between their needs and program eligibility before contacting them. Plus, it reduces the aggravation of having to repeat their personal information and trafficking story every time they want to access services. This should lead to improved survivor satisfaction with their ability to meet their needs.



Key Features of the ResourceFull App

-

SEARCH: the current approach for survivors to find the right service provider is incredibly inefficient. Detailed eligibility criteria and service provider expectations, for example, transitional housing that prohibits smoking, are not publicly available takes SO it many conversations to find the right fit. To address this, the app offers a comprehensive directory with two sides: a login for survivors to create a profile and search for providers by using filters, and another login for organizations to maintain detailed profiles, and add intake forms so they can receive referrals.



CONNECT: survivors can avoid retraumatization from repeatedly answering the same questions by maintaining a profile that autofills the service provider's intake form. They can also receive notifications on the status of their request for services. Service providers can then receive and manage incoming submissions from survivors, facilitating communication.



SECURITY: the app's architecture provides data security during transit and at rest, and safeguards personally-identifiable information. Users are given clarity about the data collected and can choose to revoke access to their information, ensuring their confidentiality, privacy, and control over their data.

Additional Considerations

- **1.** Vetting partner organizations is critical to the success of the app. ResourceFull is rolling out a process to determine which partners can maintain the level of information needed to achieve quality search results, and deliver services in line with best-in-class standards of care. The team is working with the survivor community to deepen their understanding of how best to utilize survivor voice and experience with organizations to guide each another as a community, providing recommendations and reviews in ways that are safe and protect the confidentiality of the individual.
- 2. The app can help garner more resources for the field, and better match service demand to supply. As the number of users grows, ResourceFull can quantify the gaps between searches made and available offerings, also shedding light on the characteristics of people seeking services. This can improve resource allocation at organizations, and enable them to better engage financial partners and government agencies to support the launch of specific solutions.
- **3.** The app could extend beyond anti-trafficking organizations. App development must recognize that survivors have comprehensive needs, just like any other person. Thus, the app should allow them to access a wide range of information and services, including education, job information, and benefit information, to serve survivors as whole individuals. The challenge is how to expand the app's reach and capabilities to accommodate these diverse needs.



John Nehme President and Chief Executive Officer Allies Against Slavery Using technology to obtain real-time prevalence data while facilitating survivor access to services

Mission

Allies Against Slavery builds platforms and partnerships to accelerate solutions to human trafficking.

Gaps Observed

Allies started in 2010 as a group of concerned citizens in Austin who aimed to combat human trafficking by organizing clothing drives, training law enforcement, screening films, and learning from survivors. However, challenges arose due to limited resources, confusion regarding victim identification, and disagreements about survivor's needs. The organization was eventually established as a nonprofit in 2014 and began leading the Central Texas Coalition Against Human Trafficking, focusing on improving victim identification with a network of 65 agencies. Shortly thereafter, Texas government prioritized filling gaps in care for child sex trafficking victims leading Allies to partner with the University of Texas at Austin to publish a **groundbreaking prevalence study in 2017.** The researchers estimated that there were 313,000 victims of human trafficking in Texas, highlighting a significant gap in victim identification when compared to the numbers of victims reported by the Texas Human Trafficking Prevention Taskforce and National Human Trafficking Hotline data at the time: 628 and 452, respectively.

From another research project Allies also learned that 88% of survivors reported interacting with a professional during their trafficking experience who missed the chance to identify and help them.



Addressing Gaps: Lighthouse Platform

Based on those findings, Allies developed Lighthouse, a digital platform currently being used by 190 organizations and close to 1,900 field professionals in Texas and Louisiana to identify victims of sex trafficking, learn from trends, evaluate programs, craft policies, obtain funding, and prevent exploitation.

In the last 12 months Lighthouse facilitated completion of over 38,000 screenings in Texas, 7% of which were identified as "clear concern" (highest risk level correlated to the potential for exploitation or trafficking to have occurred). While Allies is continuing to seek expansion to other states, they also have an equal focus on growing utilization of the Lighthouse platform from 66% to 75%.

Before creating Lighthouse, Allies had developed a three page PDF screening tool to help law enforcement and social services professionals understand the experiences of the people they were engaging so they could provide appropriate support. They initially envisioned capturing the data in an excel spreadsheet, but launched Lighthouse for screening instead. After meeting the team at AnnieCannons, Allies recognized that the wealth of information collected during screenings could be harnessed to inform the field. They also saw there was a dearth of deep, accessible data analysis across multiple sources to aid those working with vulnerable populations in identifying survivors and assisting them. So Allies worked with AnnieCannons to scale the Lighthouse platform, combining screening data with other relevant information. As a result, a three-dimensional view of the issue emerged which enabled a deeper understanding of trends related to victims, perpetrators, and buyers.

Allies' President and CEO John Nehme believes the ultimate opportunity in the anti-trafficking field is to use Lighthouse to build a robust model for prevention, helping communities identify vulnerabilities and proactively prevent exploitation.

Key Features of the Lighthouse Platform

HTHOUSE Viewing as: Allies - Test Organization Change Group/Organization							
/ Add CSE-IT							
troduction	Questionnaire	Score					
HOUSING	PRIOR ABUSE	PHYSICAL HEALTH ENVIRONMENT RELATIONSHIPS CURRENT	TRAUMA COERCION	EXPLOIT	ATION		
1. HOUSING AND CAREGIVING. The youth experiences housing or caregiving instability for any reason.			No Information	No Concern	Possible Concern	Clear Concern	
 a. Youth runs away or frequently leaves their residence for extended periods of time (overnight, days, weeks) 			0 0	0 0	01	<u>)</u> 2	
b. Youth ex	b. Youth experiences unstable housing, including multiple foster/group home placements			00	01	0 2	
c. Youth experiences periods of homelessness, e.g. living on the street or couch surfing			0 0	00	01	0 2	
d. Youth relies on emergency or temporary resources to meet basic needs, e.g. hygiene, shelter, food, medical care			0 0	0 0	01	○ 2	
e. Parent/caregiver is unable to provide adequate supervision			0 0	00	01	0 2	
f. Youth has highly irregular school attendance, including frequent or prolonged tardiness or absences			0 0	00	01	0 2	
g. Youth has current or past involvement with the child welfare system $\ensuremath{^{\circ}}$			0 0	00	01	0 2	
Indicator 1	Indicator 1 Score: A subtotal of 4-5 indicates Possible Concern. A subtotal a 6 indicates Clear Concern.			No Concern			

1. Screen and identify victims: Service providers create a record for each person they with, engage administering the CSE-IT screener which includes questions regarding housing, prior abuse, physical health, environment, relationships, current trauma, coercion, and exploitation. Each question is rated as "no information", "no concern", "possible concern", and "clear concern", which helps determine the person's risk for exploitation and trafficking.

2. Track services and survivor outcomes. The platform offers easy visualization of the numbers of people served, victim status, type of trafficking, demographics, and services provided. It also provides a link to a National Referral Directory for use as needed.





3. See trends from multiple data sources. This feature enables users to see the location of exploitative businesses, such as IMBs, by county and zip code, year, and population.

For stories that illustrate Allies' journey to launching the platform, and the ways service providers use Lighthouse see **"A Beacon of Hope"**.

Additional Considerations

1. Values that guided Lighthouse's design

- **a.** Tell an accurate, survivor-centered story without sensationalization. Much of the data work in the field focuses on investigations or specific stakeholders, sometimes overlooking survivors. Although survivors may not be the primary users of Lighthouse, Allies intends to guide those accessing the platform toward more effective service and care, prioritizing the genuine needs of survivors and fostering a realistic understanding of the challenges faced in the field.
- **b.** Design the interface for professionals that are not data experts. Lighthouse users primarily focus on service delivery, client care, or investigations rather than data analysis. Allies' deliberate design choices aimed to provide easily digestible data that does not demand a high level of expertise and meets users where they are, ensuring the platform adds value for the average user.
- **C. Prioritize easy access to data exploration.** The platform enables users to ask questions and explore the data themselves rather than Allies dictating what it means and conveying it to them. This approach empowers practitioners to inquire about trends, accuracy, and the stories the data tells.

2. Relationship-building informs the use of data

- **a. Trust is vital to embracing data as a tool for accountability.** Especially when data reveals shortcomings or areas where expectations aren't being met, strong relationships encourage constructive conversations that center around strategies for improvement instead of blaming.
- **b.** Data privacy and security rely on clear communication. Survivors who consent to share their data should feel empowered and informed about its usage. Education regarding the legal and ethical dimensions of data privacy, which may not always align, is also needed. In the anti-trafficking field, fostering dialogue and increasing knowledge in this area is essential to ensure that technical solutions maximize the potential of data while also safeguarding survivors.

Brooklyn Human Trafficking Task Force





Shaina Fuller Task Force Director Brooklyn Human Trafficking Task Force, Kings County District Attorney's Office

Enhancing impact through a broader view of the problem and sharing data for advocacy

Mission

The Kings County District Attorney's (DA's) Office and Safe Horizon's Anti-Trafficking Program co-chair the federally-funded Brooklyn Human Trafficking Task Force (BKHTTF). It is a multidisciplinary team that brings together law enforcement, non-governmental service providers, New York City (NYC) agencies, healthcare providers, for-profit companies, and research institutions, to combat all forms of human trafficking in NYC through:

- Coordinated and collaborative community response
- Survivor-centered approach in proactively investigating and prosecuting trafficking
- Provision of comprehensive, trauma-informed services to survivors of trafficking
- Enhanced community capacity to identify and report human trafficking

The goals of the BKHTTF, carried out by 30 consistently active members and many other interested parties, align with its mission and include:

- Developing and implementing a standard protocol for serving survivors, for use by law enforcement and service providers.
- Delivering coordinated training and outreach to community and professional groups in Brooklyn.
- Streamlining referral processes to law enforcement and service providers.
- Providing comprehensive information regarding services to all survivors.

Gaps Observed

Shaina Fuller, BKHTTF's current Task Force Director at the Kings County DA's Office, and former Coordinator of the Cook County (Illinois) Human Trafficking Task Force, made the following observations regarding gaps in services for survivors:

- Lack of holistic eligibility criteria for safe housing across geographies, impacting specific groups depending on location. For example, in NYC it is hard for single adults to find housing while in Chicago the ones with barriers are often families.
- Shelters do not meet survivors' unique housing needs. Individuals that have experienced the type of violence and trauma associated with trafficking should ideally be connected with a place that can offer a single room along with comprehensive services that will connect them with resources and inform them of alternatives to sustain freedom. When those conditions are not present, people engage in shelter-hopping which makes them vulnerable to re-trafficking.

Lack of low-barrier drop-in centers for adults in NYC. When they do not have other places to go during the day, some survivors involved in ongoing cases at the Kings County DA's office use their visitor status to come in when they are not scheduled to meet with their attorney, simply to pass the time. While the DA's office is able to provide survivors with lunch and access to toiletries and clothing if needed, the resources and staff available are not sufficient to support survivors in this way on a regular basis. When people are idle and on the street they can become more vulnerable to recruitment by traffickers.

- Lack of a bigger picture to inform service 0 delivery and lobby for additional resources to combat trafficking. Reviewing trafficking cases across organizations, not just in terms of data but quantitative also qualitative information, can bridge gaps and address disconnects between different stakeholders. This can help identify patterns, similarities, and differences in cases, facilitating a more comprehensive understanding of trafficking dynamics to inform collective advocacy efforts.
- Lack of collaboration among stakeholders beyond training and events. Providers are stretched thin and working in silos, so it is hard for them to come together to create joint solutions that involve ongoing work. The BKHTTF seeks opportunities to connect resources with the service providers who can leverage them. For example, the Director could potentially introduce a church that wants to offer their space to survivors to a service provider that wants to run a drop-in center.

Recommendations

- **Start a drop-in center that only operates a couple of days per week.** Shaina gave an example of The Salvation Army, which hired a coordinator to run a drop-in center in a safe space on Tuesdays and Thursdays as part of its case management services.
 - Visitors were free to do whatever they wanted, but were asked what they were working on so they could get access to a computer, and low-barrier case management to make progress on their goals.
 - It also offered free meals, bus cards, and entertainment such as TVs for watching movies, coloring books and art supplies, and some programming such as yoga.
 - It provided an opportunity for people to build community. Despite the risk of peer recruitment, or that traffickers might visit the space too, a basic intake, presence of staff, and basic ground rules about topics of conversation supported safety.

• Conduct semi-annual reviews of select taskforce members' cases. Without identifying personal information, stakeholders can share what they are observing among survivors served, and questions that are coming up for them as a result. Such a forum should also invite survivors leaders to provide their perspective, so that the task force can understand, for example, why some survivors do not want to prosecute traffickers while others do not want to engage in supportive services.

Provide incentives for data sharing as part of government grants. Systematic compilation of information across members will help the BKHTTF and other task forces to effectively plan and prioritize activities based on data-driven insights. Until that becomes the standard, the BKHTTF hopes to implement a vulnerability matrix tool in 2024 to assess patterns in survivors' experiences which will help guide anti-trafficking efforts.

About Enhanced Collaborative Model (ECM) task forces such as the BKHTTF

- As of February 2023, there were approximately 50 active ECM task forces across the United States and its territories that were funded by the Office for Victims of Crime (OVC).
- OVC and the Bureau of Justice Assistance (BJA), developed a Human Trafficking Task Force e-Guide to support established task forces and provide guidance to agencies that are forming task forces.

- In addition, the National Institute of Justice sponsored an evaluation of the work of the ECM task forces published in May 2021 by Urban Institute, which outlined progress made and opportunities for growth. Some of its key findings were:
 - The ECM model has helped task forces obtain resources needed to support their work.
 - Most of the evaluated ECM task forces are primarily focused on identifying and investigating sex trafficking, and are not well-positioned to address labor trafficking effectively.
 - Among study task forces, the ECM model proved largely effective in connecting stakeholders and increasing collaboration.
 - Statewide task forces struggle more than local task forces with collaboration and service provision.
 - Some local stakeholders voiced a need for federal partners to be more involved in task force activities.
 - Co-location of task force members and agency partners is valuable.
 - More and better housing options are needed for human trafficking survivors.

Futures Without Violence





Carolyne Ouya

Program Manager, Economic Security & Mobility Futures Without Violence Fostering multi-sector collaboration and trauma-informed workplaces, and tackling exploitative industries

Mission

FUTURES provides groundbreaking programs, policies, and campaigns that empower individuals and organizations working to end gender-based violence around the world. Their focus is broad, but they have dedicated anti-trafficking initiatives.

The organization works on being at the forefront of policy and program initiatives to prevent trafficking and help survivors to heal and thrive. They also provide training and technical assistance to organizations seeking to work collaboratively to effectively respond to human trafficking in their communities. FUTURES served over 500 anti-trafficking organizations in the past year.

Gaps Observed

Carolyne Ouya, Program Manager, Economic Security & Mobility at FUTURES highlighted the following gaps impacting survivors across diverse demographics:

- ♥ Gaps in services: survivors, in general, face limited safe housing options and difficulties accessing mental health services. However, male and trans-identifying survivors encounter even greater challenges in securing housing and wrap-around services. Additionally, flexible funding options from the domestic violence field have, for the most part, not transitioned to human trafficking.
- Gaps for specific groups: rural communities are under-resourced and struggle with cultural competency; the field lacks programs catering to disabled and neurodivergent communities; and there are limited economic empowerment initiatives tailored to labor trafficking survivors. Plus, the distinction between programs addressing labor rights violations versus labor trafficking is unclear.
- Gaps in collaboration: there is a need to engage and evaluate partnerships with the full breadth of faith-based anti-trafficking programs; and improve coordination for data collection methods within the field, especially economic empowerment programs since measures to assess impact in that area are limited.

_

Capacity-building gaps: language access is a challenge for training and technical assistance (TTA), which can usually be offered only in English and Spanish; in addition, popular TTA services that focused primarily on labor trafficking service delivery and trauma informed practices need to be expanded.

Additional resources compiled by FUTURES related to gaps can be found in the Appendix on page 77.



Recommendations

Carolyne described three key areas of focus for her team at FUTURES which contribute to closing gaps:

- **1.** Building collaborations since the size and scope of the problem of trafficking can only be effectively tackled by multi-sector solutions.
- 2. Addressing exploitative industries where workers have vulnerabilities and likely lack protections, such as the services sector or the gig economy.
- **3. Engaging in capacity-building** primarily to cultivate trauma-informed workplaces, and enable service providers to connect survivors to more economic opportunities.

Ideas for effective collaboration

- Be human-centered. Establish partnerships by focusing on the personal relationship first. That means actively supporting and getting to know one another, and showing up to participate in each other's offerings.
- Be realistic about capacity. While everyone may get excited about the potential that can be unleashed by collaborating, it is important to tailor the partnership to current staff, financial and grant scope limitations.
- Meaningfully engage survivors. Go beyond asking survivors to share their story, involving them also in project design, facilitation, and decision-making. This toolkit by the National Survivor Network provides frameworks for that purpose. Survivors with the required skills can be identified through service providers, or through initiatives like the Survivor Alliance Network's Pembrook Fellowship.
- Plug into other local initiatives. Before launching services, investigate the coalition, public health, and economic development goals and projects already in place that can be leveraged. FUTURES has Community developed а Resource Mapping Toolkit for that purpose as part of its Building Collaborative Responses to Human Trafficking collection of online resources.
- Formally evaluate the partnership. Tools such as Caminar Latino's Centering Racial Equity in Collaboration Survey enable stakeholders to identify aspects of a collaboration that are working well and opportunities for improvement, both across partner organizations and within specific work groups.

•

Ideas for addressing exploitative industries

- Put workers at the center. Create structures and spaces for workers to lead in creating the solutions and the initiatives to make their workplaces safer.
- Champion initiatives using a business 0 perspective. Motivate companies to implement worker protections by showing them how they impact the bottom line, doing due diligence to prove that a focus on employee well-being will reduce operating costs due to lower turnover and improved productivity as shown by Gallup in an article titled "Employee Wellbeing Is Key for Workplace Productivity". It is not enough to appeal to human compassion when lobbying for better working conditions.



- Engage groups focused on worker rights. Unions and other worker-centered alliances, industry associations, and the U.S. Department of Labor can provide strength in numbers for influencing businesses to change their workplace policies.
- Measure progress in the direction of change. Since advocacy work takes time to yield fruit, Carolyne knows her team is succeeding at transforming workplaces when:
 - Workers widely share and use tools they developed to advocate for themselves, such as the ones that janitorial staff have created with guidance from FUTURES;
 - Companies increase the number of job opportunities open to people with non-traditional backgrounds; and
 - FUTURES has an ongoing dialog with organizations about how to tackle the barriers to executing worker safety and retention initiatives.

Ideas and resources for capacity-building

Q To cultivate trauma-informed workplaces,

- Recognize trauma impacts employee productivity and retention.
- Engage employees holistically since home life affects work, and vice versa.
- Facilitate access to culturally-aware mental health services.
- Encourage organizations to adopt and expand the U.S. Surgeon General's Framework for Workplace Mental Health & Well-being.
- Capitalize on FUTURES' Workplaces Respond to Domestic & Sexual Violence online resources, TTA and consulting services.



Q To build partnerships to address survivors' needs,

- FUTURES' Building Partnerships and Collaborations with Workforce and Education Systems, includes a guide and a case study collection to create economic security for survivors. It is one of the resources of its Promoting Employment Opportunities for Survivors of Trafficking (PEOST) initiative.
- FUTURES' Health Partners on IPV + Exploitation, equips community health centers to partner with domestic violence (DV) and sexual assault (SA) advocacy programs, for improved prevention, identification, and referrals to services.

Safe House Project





Kristi Wells Chief Executive Officer Safe House Project Grow emergency beds, advocate with local government, and offer low-barrier housing for diverse survivors

Mission

Holding the audacious belief that eradication of child trafficking is possible through the power of unity, compassion, and collective action, Safe House Project's mission is to:

- Increase survivor identification beyond one percent through education. Since inception they have trained over 300,000 people to identify and report trafficking.
- Provide emergency services and placement to all survivors, and ensure every survivor can access quality, safe housing and holistic care. They tend to work with individuals that are hard to place.

They are on track to serve 584 survivors by the end of 2023, which represents a 370% increase over 2022.

Since 2018, they have added 371 new beds to the national landscape for survivors to receive safe housing and the services they need to heal.

Safe House Project has established a housing continuum of care, quantifying the percentage of trafficking-specific organizations offering each type of housing as of 2022:

- Emergency housing (23% of programs) lasts up to 90 days and allows survivors to secure immediate shelter, food and clothing upon leaving a trafficking situation.
- Transitional housing (14% of programs) lasts 6-12 months, and involves life skills training, counseling, economic empowerment and education.
- Long-term housing (62% of programs) lasts 12-24 months, and involves independent living arrangements with some wrap around services.



Gaps Observed

Co-Founder and Chief Executive Officer, Kristi Wells, and the Safe House Project team have identified the gaps in safe housing for survivors of trafficking outlined below, some of which they are addressing through their fundraising and programming efforts.

- Lack of emergency housing. Many people require a place to stay and support on the day they decide to leave their trafficking situation, but shelters do not provide a sense of security nor appropriate stabilization services. Organizations that only focus on survivors of trafficking and can provide crisis housing are not as ubiquitous.
- **Q** Lack of low-barrier housing options. Criteria used to determine eligibility and living arrangement rules make it difficult for some groups to find appropriate housing, such as transgender individuals, and people who smoke or use substances.
- Lack of trauma-informed housing. Housing requirements are often too stringent and may mirror the control that survivors experienced during trafficking. Survivors and staff need to be better equipped to manage trauma triggers and de-escalation effectively, especially in short-term living situations. Plus, there is a need for housing that can accommodate those with more acute mental health needs.

✔ Long lead times to access transitional housing. While several organizations provide transitional housing, there is still a shortage of such facilities. Transitional homes have very limited capacity (e.g. 6-10 beds) so it can take two or more weeks for a survivor to enroll, which in turn leads to delays in accessing critical services for them to start healing and avoid returning to their trafficking situation.

Lack of affordable independent living options. Access to affordable housing is a challenge not only for survivors but also for many other individuals, especially people of color in poverty. In addition, some survivors experience severe mental health issues which prevent them from pursuing economic empowerment options to pay rent even when they are eligible for subsidies.



- Lack of national-level housing solutions for survivors. It is hard for local nonprofits to support survivors who need to move out of their current community for various reasons, such as reuniting with their children, or avoiding unsafe people.
- Lack of housing options for families with teenagers. Concerns about exposing adolescents over the age of 12 to potentially harmful situations and the need for gender-segregated housing pose challenges in accommodating this population.
- Lack of capacity and skills for advocacy. Service providers are narrowly focused on the needs of survivors, and the anti-trafficking field is relatively new, so it is not easy for organizations to gather the right data to develop the case for funding specialized housing for survivors.

Recommendations

- Encourage each service provider to add two emergency beds. It could be a separate apartment, or a space in a transitional home. The latter arrangement may require planning to avoid disrupting the stability of the home.
- Address emergency housing more holistically. Organizations can come together to facilitate the launch of 10 emergency housing facilities in different geographies, to shelter 10-12 survivors each with an annual budget of \$500,000-\$750,000 per home.
- Influence local government to fund specialized shelters. Service providers can join forces to identify the percentage of individuals in domestic violence shelters who are also survivors of trafficking, so they can work with local governments to better allocate resources for creating dedicated emergency housing for survivors. State support and public-private partnerships are essential to tackling housing issues.

- Design housing programs for low-barrier, individualized interventions. Focus on being truly survivor-centered, which means finding ways to cater to a diversity of experiences, expectations, and circumstances, all under one roof.
- Join subsidies with economic empowerment for 0 independent living. Establish a base of funding, using government grants and private donations, to engage mission-driven landlord partners to offer survivors affordable rents. Couple that with a titration system, where survivors pay 10% of the rent to start and the percentage gradually increases with gains in financial stability. Kristi mentioned that Survivor Ventures in Norfolk, Virginia executes a model that brings together best-in-class independent living with economic empowerment.
- Grow trauma-informed care. Equipping staff and survivors to de-escalate and navigate conflicts will allow service providers to reduce their reliance on rules for creating safe living spaces.
- Improve fundraising capacity. Emphasizing the importance of data and better grant-writing skills will also enable organizations to garner resources to improve their housing options for survivors.

Focus on Northeast Service Providers

Housing is the biggest gap, and fragmentation hinders impact

After evaluating the gaps in services at the state and metropolitan area levels, Restore identified that the areas surrounding its current operations, specifically the Northeast Corridor from Baltimore to Boston, lacked anti-trafficking services.

To better understand the needs of the organizations in those underserved areas, Restore requested interviews and sent surveys to service providers from the National Human Trafficking Hotline referral directory. The team contacted 11 Tier 1 organizations which are dedicated to trafficking, and 28 Tier 2 organizations which have a broader focus than trafficking but that offer a trafficking-specific program or staff.

The goal of the outreach was to confirm the gaps observed by the service providers, which gaps were a priority for them to address, and assess their interest in partnering with another organization or engaging consultants to pursue action plans.

Respondent Characteristics

The following were the core competencies and long-term services identified by the 14 organizations interviewed, 11 of which also completed Restore's survey:



Types of Long-Term Services Provided



Gaps Identified

Below are the gaps most commonly identified by this group of organizations, with housing being by far their number one priority to be addressed:



Specifically related to housing, service providers mentioned the following challenges:

- Lack of immediately available Ο and appropriate emergency housing dedicated to survivors of trafficking. Current options to place survivors in domestic violence shelters or motels are usually located in areas accessible to traffickers where they can be recruited again. Safe housing for minors, and survivors with families or pets was also hard to find. A couple of providers mentioned working with hotels and using platform for ReloShare, a booking affordable hotel rooms for survivors of domestic violence, as options for providing emergency shelter.
- Lack of transitional housing that is low-barrier and dedicated to survivors of trafficking. One provider mentioned that available options centered around drug and alcohol rehab programs, so they allowed survivors to stay in their emergency shelter for up to five months if survivors are working on goals though the shelter is not set up for that purpose.

Lack of affordable long-term housing. High rents and 0 new housing inventory focused on luxury housing were mentioned as a challenge not only in major metros such as New York City, but also in smaller cities such as Albany and Buffalo in New York State and in Maryland. Providers shared that affordable housing is not usually located near job opportunities, so the lack of public transportation especially in suburban areas such as Long Island also prevents survivors from achieving the financial stability needed to access safe housing. In addition, there is a lack of landlords that can present a W9 to receive government funds to house survivors. Plus, credit repair and vacating convictions related to trafficking and exploitation takes time and creates a barrier for survivors to secure housing.

These service providers were addressing housing gaps in the following ways:

555% Bave identified specific partners for addressing gaps Direct financial assistance, the second most common gap mentioned, also ensures survivors' access to stable and safe housing, as well as to education and training for career development. More economic empowerment programs are also needed for survivors to achieve financial independence.

Finally, organizations also indicated that service delivery is challenging due to insufficient resources to retain staff, develop infrastructure, and conduct impact assessment. Furthermore, they identified the small scale of organizations within the field, a lack of capabilities to serve survivors among providers outside the anti-trafficking domain, and a lack of industry standards and frameworks for measuring the impact of anti-trafficking efforts, as barriers to a more effective and comprehensive approach to combating human trafficking.



Meet the Leaders



Jakki Bedsole Product Manager AnnieCannons anniecannons.org resourcefullapp.org

Jakki Bedsole is AnnieCannons' Product Manager for ResourceFull, a mobile platform for survivors of trafficking dedicated to generating exit-ramps from exploitation. As an activist in the local and national anti-trafficking movement, Jakki has served in a multitude of roles. She has been a direct service provider working with vulnerable populations, a researcher and writer speaking to the prevalence of and disparities among domestic sex trafficking survivors, a public speaker and trainer educating communities about trafficking and gender-based violence and a nonprofit leader overseeing program delivery and leading in the areas of program, organizational, fund and team development.

Jakki holds a B.A. in Sociology, a Masters of Social Work (MSW) and has experience in an array of roles within the tech industry including product, design and engineering. She is dedicated to building power among marginalized communities through the development of social impact technology.

Shaina Fuller is the Director of the Brooklyn Human Trafficking Task Force, a federally funded task force co-chaired by the Human Trafficking Unit at the Kings County District Attorney's Office and the Anti-Trafficking Program at Safe Horizon. In her role, Shaina facilitates collaboration among relevant social service, law enforcement, legal service and community partners in Brooklyn and coordinates training on human trafficking identification and response.

Prior to entering the anti-trafficking field in Brooklyn, Shaina was the Coordinator of the Cook County Human Trafficking Task Force in Chicago where she also chaired the Healthcare Subcommittee of the Task Force. Shaina received her master's degree in Public Health from the University of Illinois at Chicago and believes in a comprehensive public health approach to preventing and mitigating the impact of human trafficking in our communities.



Shaina Fuller

Task Force Director Brooklyn Human Trafficking Task Force, Kings County District Attorney's Office brooklynda.org/human-trafficking



Laura Hackney Chief Executive Officer and Cofounder AnnieCannons anniecannons.org resourcefullapp.org Laura Hackney is the Cofounder and Executive Director of AnnieCannons, an organization working to transform survivors of human trafficking into software professionals. Laura is a full-stack software engineer, and she leads AnnieCannons' curriculum development, nonprofit partnerships, and trauma-informed care and work model. She was previously the manager of the Program on Human Rights at Stanford University, and worked as the Senior Research Associate for Stanford's Anti-Trafficking Project in the Mekong Sub-Region and was a program associate for the Freeman Spogli Institute's International Policy Implementation Lab. She holds a Master's degree from Stanford, and a BA from the University of California, Berkeley.

In addition to analyzing various forms of human trafficking around the world, she has extensively investigated the specific issue of trafficking Burmese women and children into the marriage market of China. Domestically, she works with the Human Trafficking Task Force within the San Francisco Police Department's Special Victims Unit and supports the local Bay Area anti-trafficking groups.

After leading Allies as a volunteer for three years, John managed the organization's transition from a grassroots movement to a nonprofit in 2014. Under his leadership, Allies has supported thousands of trafficking survivors, successfully petitioned the Austin City Council to unanimously pass a slave-free city resolution, tripled the size of the Central Texas Coalition Against Human Trafficking, and launched Lighthouse, an innovative software platform to identify victims and visualize data.

John also forged a research partnership between Allies and the University of Texas, funded by the Texas Governor's Office, and co-authored the groundbreaking study "Human Trafficking by the Numbers: The Initial Benchmark of Prevalence and Economic Impact for Texas". He also serves as an expert witness in sex trafficking cases across Texas. John has a degree in Human and Organizational Development from Vanderbilt University, where he studied as an Ingram Scholar. He earned a Master of Political Economy from the University of Sydney in Australia as a Rotary Ambassadorial Scholar.



John Nehme President and Chief Executive Officer Allies Against Slavery alliesagainstslavery.org



Carolyne Ouya

Program Manager, Economic Security & Mobility Futures Without Violence futureswithoutviolence.org

Carolyne Ouya is dedicated to improving education and employment access for survivors of trafficking and gender-based violence. Formerly, she served as Director of Strategic Partnerships at Access Youth & Immigration Services, a major victim rights and employment agency in San Diego County.

Carolyne's commitment to culturally specific solutions is evident through her work as a legal advocate for survivors in African/East African communities. She's also been Director of Education at Silayan Filipina, a women's leadership and community development organization. As part of the Live Well San Diego Community Leadership Team, Carolyne has facilitated county-wide public health initiatives, focusing on behavioral health and economic mobility.

She holds an undergraduate degree in Psychology & Public Health from Santa Clara University and is currently pursuing a master's in Marriage, Family, and Therapy at The Chicago School of Professional Psychology.

Katie Steinberg is a Washington, DC based attorney. She has been with Polaris (the organization that operates the Human Trafficking Hotline) since 2017. As Hotline Partnerships Manager she oversees the Service Provider Partnerships team and the Law Enforcement Partnerships team. These teams determine which service providers and law enforcement agencies are included in the referral and reporting protocols for the Hotline. The teams interview prospective partners and review their applications for inclusion. The teams also handle grievances that Hotline callers share about service providers and law enforcement agencies. This vetting process is required by the cooperative agreement that Polaris has with the US Department of Health and Human Services to operate the Hotline.



Katie Steinberg

Partnerships Manager, National Human Trafficking Hotline | Polaris humantraffickinghotline.org polarisproject.org



Fen Wang Mixed Media Artist and Restore Survivor Advisory Board Member *restorenyc.org*



Kristi Wells is a prominent expert combating human trafficking in the United States. In 2017, she co-founded Safe House Project, a nonprofit dedicated to addressing trafficking issues in the country. Motivated by the alarming prevalence of trafficking in the United States and the lack of safe housing for survivors, Kristi has spearheaded the organization's growth. Under her leadership, Safe House Project has emerged as a central figure in the anti-trafficking arena, raising millions of dollars to establish safe homes nationwide, aiding countless victims in escaping traffickers, and training diverse communities in recognizing, reporting, and preventing trafficking. The organization also convenes the Trafficking Survivor Equity Coalition, uniting over 500 stakeholders.

Kristi's expertise extends to advising federal and state legislators, as well as Fortune 500 companies, promoting a coordinated, collaborative, public-private national response to trafficking. Her vision and dedication have positively impacted hundreds of survivors, inspiring others to join the fight against this heinous crime.

Fen Wang was born and raised in mainland China. She immigrated to New York at the age of 29. She's a self-taught artist who discovered art as a pathway to healing and joy. A trafficking survivor herself, she now works as a survivor advocate helping others with stories like hers to find freedom and wholeness. Her true identity emerged from life's trials, where she discovered the innate purity, goodness and courage within herself. She's raising her daughter to know the beauty, fun and joy of art.



Kristi Wells Chief Executive Officer Safe House Project safehouseproject.org

Appendix

Additional Resources on Gaps in Anti-Trafficking Services

1. OVC Trends in Service Delivery from OVC Anti-Trafficking Grantees (2023)

Futures Without Violence Resources

- 2. Human Trafficking Leadership Academy Class 5 Recommendations
- 3. Human Trafficking Leadership Academy
- 4. Barriers & Bridge Makers (Love Never Fails Technology Academy)
- 5. Analyzing Service Barriers for Trafficked Persons in Context of U.S. Refugee Program
- 6. Addressing the Needs of Victims of Human Trafficking: Challenges, Barriers, and Promising Practices
- 7. Identifying Gaps in Human Trafficking Mental Health Service Provision
- 8. Identifying service needs and service gaps for sexually exploited/trafficked persons in Missouri
- 9. The White House National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking

Additional Resources on Standards of Service

- 1. Achieving Excellence: Model Standards for Serving Victims & Survivors of Crime, Office for Victims of Crime (OVC) e-publication
- 2. Standards of Care for Anti-Trafficking Service Providers (Standards of Care) Project, led by Freedom Network USA in partnership with OVC and the Department of Health and Human Services' Office on Trafficking in Persons (OTIP)
- 3. Standards of Care for the US Anti-Trafficking Field, Freedom Network USA white paper from June 2019